

1 CECILY A. WATERMAN, State Bar No. 063502  
JENNIFER A. LOCKHART, State Bar No. 236972  
2 MORGAN, LEWIS & BOCKIUS LLP  
One Market  
3 Spear Street Tower  
San Francisco, CA 94105  
4 Tel: 415.442.1000  
Fax: 415.442.1001

5 Attorneys for Defendant  
6 BOSTON SCIENTIFIC CORPORATION

7 DAVID SCHER, State Bar No. 184562  
R. SCOTT OSWALD, Pro Hac Vice  
8 THE EMPLOYMENT LAW GROUP, P.C.  
888 17th Street, NW, Suite 900  
9 Washington, D.C. 20006  
Telephone: (202) 261-2806  
10 Facsimile: (202) 261-2835

11 Attorney for Plaintiff  
ERIC WILLIAMS

12 UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
13 NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA  
14

15 Case No. 3:08-CV-01437-WHA

16 ERIC WILLIAMS,

17 Plaintiff,

STIPULATED PROTECTIVE ORDER

18 vs.

19 BOSTON SCIENTIFIC CORPORATION,  
JAMES TOBIN, WILLIAM R.  
20 ROSKOPF, JENNIFER A. HEGNER  
AND THOMAS J. O'CONNELL, JR.

21 Defendants.  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27

1           1.     PURPOSES AND LIMITATIONS

2           Disclosure and discovery activity in this action are likely to involve production of  
3 confidential, proprietary, or private information for which special protection from public  
4 disclosure and from use for any purpose other than prosecuting this litigation would be warranted.  
5 Accordingly, the parties hereby stipulate to and petition the court to enter the following Stipulated  
6 Protective Order. The parties acknowledge that this Order does not confer blanket protections on  
7 all disclosures or responses to discovery and that the protection it affords extends only to the  
8 limited information or items that are entitled under the applicable legal principles to treatment as  
9 confidential. The parties further acknowledge, as set forth in Section 10, below, that this  
10 Stipulated Protective Order creates no entitlement to file confidential information under seal;  
11 Civil Local Rule 79-5 sets forth the procedures that must be followed and reflects the standards  
12 that will be applied when a party seeks permission from the court to file material under seal.

13           2.     DEFINITIONS

14                     2.1     Party: any party to this action, including all of its officers, directors,  
15 employees, consultants, retained experts, and outside counsel (and their support staff).

16                     2.2     Disclosure or Discovery Material: all items or information,  
17 regardless of the medium or manner generated, stored, or maintained (including, among  
18 other things, testimony, transcripts, or tangible things) that are produced or generated in  
19 disclosures or responses to discovery in this matter.

20                     2.3     "Confidential" Information or Items: information (regardless of  
21 how generated, stored or maintained) or tangible things that qualify for protection under  
22 standards developed under F.R.Civ.P. 26(c).

23                     2.4     "Highly Confidential – Attorneys' Eyes Only" Information or  
24 Items: extremely sensitive "Confidential Information or Items" whose disclosure to  
25 another Party or nonparty would create a substantial risk of serious injury that could not  
26 be avoided by less restrictive means.

27                     2.5     Receiving Party: a Party that receives Disclosure or Discovery  
28 Material from a Producing Party.

2.6 Producing Party: a Party or non-party that produces Disclosure or Discovery Material in this action.

2.7 Designating Party: a Party or non-party that designates information or items that it produces in disclosures or in responses to discovery as “Confidential” or “Highly Confidential — Attorneys’ Eyes Only.”

2.8 Protected Material: any Disclosure or Discovery Material that is designated as “Confidential” or as “Highly Confidential – Attorneys’ Eyes Only.”

2.9 Outside Counsel: attorneys who are not employees of a Party but who are retained to represent or advise a Party in this action.

2.10 House Counsel: attorneys who are employees of a Party.

2.11 Counsel (without qualifier): Outside Counsel and House Counsel (as well as their support staffs).

2.12 Expert: a person with specialized knowledge or experience in a matter pertinent to the litigation who has been retained by a Party or its counsel to serve as an expert witness or as a consultant in this action and who is not a past or a current employee of a Party or of a competitor of a Party’s and who, at the time of retention, is not anticipated to become an employee of a Party or a competitor of a Party’s. This definition includes a professional jury or trial consultant retained in connection with this litigation.

2.13 Professional Vendors: persons or entities that provide litigation support services (e.g., photocopying; videotaping; translating; preparing exhibits or demonstrations; organizing, storing, retrieving data in any form or medium; etc.) and their employees and subcontractors.

### 3. SCOPE

The protections conferred by this Stipulation and Order cover not only Protected Material (as defined above), but also any information copied or extracted therefrom, as well as all copies, excerpts, summaries, or compilations thereof, plus testimony, conversations, or presentations by parties or counsel to or in court or in other settings that might reveal Protected Material.

///

1           4.     DURATION

2           Even after the termination of this litigation, the confidentiality obligations imposed by this  
3 Order shall remain in effect until a Designating Party agrees otherwise in writing or a court order  
4 otherwise directs.

5           5.     DESIGNATING PROTECTED MATERIAL

6                     5.1     Exercise of Restraint and Care in Designating Material for  
7 Protection. Each Party or non-party that designates information or items for protection  
8 under this Order must take care to limit any such designation to specific material that  
9 qualifies under the appropriate standards. A Designating Party must take care to designate  
10 for protection only those parts of material, documents, items, or oral or written  
11 communications that qualify – so that other portions of the material, documents, items, or  
12 communications for which protection is not warranted are not swept unjustifiably within  
13 the ambit of this Order.

14           Mass, indiscriminate, or routinized designations are prohibited. Designations that are  
15 shown to be clearly unjustified, or that have been made for an improper purpose (e.g., to  
16 unnecessarily encumber or retard the case development process, or to impose unnecessary  
17 expenses and burdens on other parties), expose the Designating Party to sanctions.

18           If it comes to a Party's or a non-party's attention that information or items that it  
19 designated for protection do not qualify for protection at all, or do not qualify for the level of  
20 protection initially asserted, that Party or non-party must promptly notify all other parties that it is  
21 withdrawing the mistaken designation.

22                     5.2     Manner and Timing of Designations. Except as otherwise provided  
23 in this Order (see, e.g., second paragraph of section 5.2(a), below), or as otherwise  
24 stipulated or ordered, material that qualifies for protection under this Order must be  
25 clearly so designated before the material is disclosed or produced.

26           Designation in conformity with this Order requires:

27                     (a)     for information in documentary form (apart from transcripts of  
28 depositions or other pretrial or trial proceedings), that the Producing Party affix the legend



1 “CONFIDENTIAL” or “HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL – ATTORNEYS’ EYES ONLY” at the top  
 2 of each page that contains protected material. If only a portion or portions of the material on a  
 3 page qualifies for protection, the Producing Party also must clearly identify the protected  
 4 portion(s) (e.g., by making appropriate markings in the margins) and must specify, for each  
 5 portion, the level of protection being asserted (either “CONFIDENTIAL” or “HIGHLY  
 6 CONFIDENTIAL – ATTORNEYS’ EYES ONLY”).

7 A Party or non-party that makes original documents or materials available  
 8 for inspection need not designate them for protection until after the inspecting Party has indicated  
 9 which material it would like copied and produced. During the inspection and before the  
 10 designation, all of the material made available for inspection shall be deemed “HIGHLY  
 11 CONFIDENTIAL – ATTORNEYS’ EYES ONLY.” After the inspecting Party has identified the  
 12 documents it wants copied and produced, the Producing Party must determine which documents,  
 13 or portions thereof, qualify for protection under this Order, then, before producing the specified  
 14 documents, the Producing Party must affix the appropriate legend (“CONFIDENTIAL” or  
 15 “HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL – ATTORNEYS’ EYES ONLY”) at the top of each page that  
 16 contains Protected Material. If only a portion or portions of the material on a page qualifies for  
 17 protection, the Producing Party also must clearly identify the protected portion(s) (e.g., by making  
 18 appropriate markings in the margins) and must specify, for each portion, the level of protection  
 19 being asserted (either “CONFIDENTIAL” or “HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL – ATTORNEYS’  
 20 EYES ONLY”).

21 (b) for testimony given in deposition or in other pretrial or trial  
 22 proceedings, that the Party or non-party offering or sponsoring the testimony identify on the  
 23 record, before the close of the deposition, hearing, or other proceeding, all protected testimony,  
 24 and further specify any portions of the testimony that qualify as “HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL –  
 25 ATTORNEYS’ EYES ONLY.” When it is impractical to identify separately each portion of  
 26 testimony that is entitled to protection, and when it appears that substantial portions of the  
 27 testimony may qualify for protection, the Party or non-party that sponsors, offers, or gives the  
 28 testimony may invoke on the record (before the deposition or proceeding is concluded) a right to

1 have up to 20 days to identify the specific portions of the testimony as to which protection is  
 2 sought and to specify the level of protection being asserted (“CONFIDENTIAL” or “HIGHLY  
 3 CONFIDENTIAL – ATTORNEYS’ EYES ONLY”). Only those portions of the testimony that  
 4 are appropriately designated for protection within the 20 days shall be covered by the provisions  
 5 of this Stipulated Protective Order.

6 Transcript pages containing Protected Material must be separately bound  
 7 by the court reporter, who must affix to the top of each such page the legend “CONFIDENTIAL”  
 8 or “HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL – ATTORNEYS’ EYES ONLY,” as instructed by the Party or  
 9 nonparty offering or sponsoring the witness or presenting the testimony.

10 (c) for information produced in some form other than documentary,  
 11 and for any other tangible items, that the Producing Party affix in a prominent place on the  
 12 exterior of the container or containers in which the information or item is stored the legend  
 13 “CONFIDENTIAL” or “HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL – ATTORNEYS’ EYES ONLY.” If only  
 14 portions of the information or item warrant protection, the Producing Party, to the extent  
 15 practicable, shall identify the protected portions, specifying whether they qualify as  
 16 “Confidential” or as “Highly Confidential – Attorneys’ Eyes Only.”

17 5.3 Inadvertent Failures to Designate. If timely corrected, an  
 18 inadvertent failure to designate qualified information or items as “Confidential” or  
 19 “Highly Confidential – Attorneys’ Eyes Only” does not, standing alone, waive the  
 20 Designating Party’s right to secure protection under this Order for such material. If  
 21 material is appropriately designated as “Confidential” or “Highly Confidential –  
 22 Attorneys’ Eyes Only” after the material was initially produced, the Receiving Party, on  
 23 timely notification of the designation, must make reasonable efforts to assure that the  
 24 material is treated in accordance with the provisions of this Order.

## 25 6. CHALLENGING CONFIDENTIALITY DESIGNATIONS

26 6.1 Timing of Challenges. Unless a prompt challenge to a Designating  
 27 Party’s confidentiality designation is necessary to avoid foreseeable substantial unfairness,  
 28 unnecessary economic burdens, or a later significant disruption or delay of the litigation, a

1 Party does not waive its right to challenge a confidentiality designation by electing not to  
2 mount a challenge promptly after the original designation is disclosed.

3 6.2 Meet and Confer. A Party that elects to initiate a challenge to a  
4 Designating Party's confidentiality designation must do so in good faith and must begin  
5 the process by conferring directly (in voice to voice dialogue; other forms of  
6 communication are not sufficient) with counsel for the Designating Party. In conferring,  
7 the challenging Party must explain the basis for its belief that the confidentiality  
8 designation was not proper and must give the Designating Party an opportunity to review  
9 the designated material, to reconsider the circumstances, and, if no change in designation  
10 is offered, to explain the basis for the chosen designation. A challenging Party may  
11 proceed to the next stage of the challenge process only if it has engaged in this meet and  
12 confer process first.

13 6.3 Judicial Intervention. A Party that elects to press a challenge to a  
14 confidentiality designation after considering the justification offered by the Designating  
15 Party may file and serve a motion under Civil Local Rule 7 (and in compliance with Civil  
16 Local Rule 79-5, if applicable) that identifies the challenged material and sets forth in  
17 detail the basis for the challenge. Each such motion must be accompanied by a competent  
18 declaration that affirms that the movant has complied with the meet and confer  
19 requirements imposed in the preceding paragraph and that sets forth with specificity the  
20 justification for the confidentiality designation that was given by the Designating Party in  
21 the meet and confer dialogue.

22 The burden of persuasion in any such challenge proceeding shall be on the Designating  
23 Party. Until the court rules on the challenge, all parties shall continue to afford the material in  
24 question the level of protection to which it is entitled under the Producing Party's designation.

## 25 7. ACCESS TO AND USE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL

26 7.1 Basic Principles. A Receiving Party may use Protected Material  
27 that is disclosed or produced by another Party or by a non-party in connection with this  
28 case only for prosecuting, defending, or attempting to settle this litigation. Such Protected



1 Material may be disclosed only to the categories of persons and under the conditions  
 2 described in this Order. When the litigation has been terminated, a Receiving Party must  
 3 comply with the provisions of section 11, below (FINAL DISPOSITION).

4 Protected Material must be stored and maintained by a Receiving Party at a location and  
 5 in a secure manner that ensures that access is limited to the persons authorized under this Order.

6 7.2 Disclosure of "CONFIDENTIAL" Information or Items. Unless  
 7 otherwise ordered by the court or permitted in writing by the Designating Party, a  
 8 Receiving Party may disclose any information or item designated CONFIDENTIAL only  
 9 to:

10 (a) the Receiving Party's Outside Counsel of record in this action, as  
 11 well as employees of said Counsel to whom it is reasonably necessary to disclose the information  
 12 for this litigation and who have signed the "Agreement to Be Bound by Protective Order" that is  
 13 attached hereto as Exhibit A;

14 (b) the officers, directors, and employees (including House Counsel) of  
 15 the Receiving Party to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this litigation and who have  
 16 signed the "Agreement to Be Bound by Protective Order" (Exhibit A);

17 (c) experts (as defined in this Order) of the Receiving Party to whom  
 18 disclosure is reasonably necessary for this litigation and who have signed the "Agreement to Be  
 19 Bound by Protective Order" (Exhibit A);

20 (d) the Court and its personnel;

21 (e) court reporters, their staffs, and professional vendors to whom  
 22 disclosure is reasonably necessary for this litigation and who have signed the "Agreement to Be  
 23 Bound by Protective Order" (Exhibit A);

24 (f) during their depositions, witnesses in the action to whom disclosure  
 25 is reasonably necessary and who have signed the "Agreement to Be Bound by Protective Order"  
 26 (Exhibit A). Pages of transcribed deposition testimony or exhibits to depositions that reveal  
 27 Protected Material must be separately bound by the court reporter and may not be disclosed to  
 28 anyone except as permitted under this Stipulated Protective Order.



1 (g) the author of the document or the original source of the  
2 information.

3 7.3 Disclosure of "HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL – ATTORNEYS'  
4 EYES ONLY" Information or Items. Unless otherwise ordered by the court or permitted  
5 in writing by the Designating Party, a Receiving Party may disclose any information or  
6 item designated "HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL – ATTORNEYS' EYES ONLY" only to:

7 (a) the Receiving Party's Outside Counsel of record in this action, as  
8 well as employees of said Counsel to whom it is reasonably necessary to disclose the information  
9 for this litigation and who have signed the "Agreement to Be Bound by Protective Order" that is  
10 attached hereto as Exhibit A;

11 (b) Experts (as defined in this Order) (1) to whom disclosure is  
12 reasonably necessary for this litigation, (2) who have signed the "Agreement to Be Bound by  
13 Protective Order" (Exhibit A), and (3) as to whom the procedures set forth in paragraph 7.4,  
14 below, have been followed;

15 (c) the Court and its personnel;

16 (d) court reporters, their staffs, and professional vendors to whom  
17 disclosure is reasonably necessary for this litigation and who have signed the "Agreement to Be  
18 Bound by Protective Order" (Exhibit A); and

19 (e) the author of the document or the original source of the  
20 information.

21 7.4 Procedures for Approving Disclosure of "HIGHLY  
22 CONFIDENTIAL – ATTORNEYS' EYES ONLY" Information or Items to "Experts":

23 (a) Unless otherwise ordered by the court or agreed in writing by the  
24 Designating Party, a Party that seeks to disclose to an "Expert" (as defined in this Order) any  
25 information or item that has been designated "HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL – ATTORNEYS'  
26 EYES ONLY" first must make a written request to the Designating Party that (1) identifies the  
27 specific HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL information that the Receiving Party seeks permission to  
28 disclose to the Expert, (2) sets forth the full name of the Expert and the city and state of his or her

1 primary residence, (3) attaches a copy of the Expert's current resume, (4) identifies the Expert's  
2 current employer(s), (5) identifies each person or entity from whom the Expert has received  
3 compensation for work in his or her areas of expertise or to whom the expert has provided  
4 professional services at any time during the preceding five years, and (6) identifies (by name and  
5 number of the case, filing date, and location of court) any litigation in connection with which the  
6 Expert has provided any professional services during the preceding five years.

7 (b) A Party that makes a request and provides the information specified  
8 in the preceding paragraph may disclose the subject Protected Material to the identified Expert  
9 unless, within seven court days of delivering the request, the Party receives a written objection  
10 from the Designating Party. Any such objection must set forth in detail the grounds on which it is  
11 based.

12 (c) A Party that receives a timely written objection must meet and  
13 confer with the Designating Party (through direct voice to voice dialogue) to try to resolve the  
14 matter by agreement. If no agreement is reached, the Party seeking to make the disclosure to the  
15 Expert may file a motion as provided in Civil Local Rule 7 (and in compliance with Civil Local  
16 Rule 79-5, if applicable) seeking permission from the court to do so. Any such motion must  
17 describe the circumstances with specificity, set forth in detail the reasons for which the disclosure  
18 to the Expert is reasonably necessary, assess the risk of harm that the disclosure would entail and  
19 suggest any additional means that might be used to reduce that risk. In addition, any such motion  
20 must be accompanied by a competent declaration in which the movant describes the parties'  
21 efforts to resolve the matter by agreement (i.e., the extent and the content of the meet and confer  
22 discussions) and sets forth the reasons advanced by the Designating Party for its refusal to  
23 approve the disclosure.

24 In any such proceeding the Party opposing disclosure to the Expert shall  
25 bear the burden of proving that the risk of harm that the disclosure would entail (under the  
26 safeguards proposed) outweighs the Receiving Party's need to disclose the Protected Material to  
27 its Expert.

28

1           8.     PROTECTED MATERIAL SUBPOENAED OR ORDERED PRODUCED IN  
 2     OTHER LITIGATION.

3           If a Receiving Party is served with a subpoena or an order issued in other litigation  
 4     that would compel disclosure of any information or items designated in this action as  
 5     “CONFIDENTIAL” or “HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL – ATTORNEYS’ EYES ONLY,” the  
 6     Receiving Party must so notify the Designating Party, in writing (by fax, if possible) immediately  
 7     and in no event more than three court days after receiving the subpoena or order. Such  
 8     notification must include a copy of the subpoena or court order.

9           The Receiving Party also must immediately inform in writing the party who  
 10    caused the subpoena or order to issue in the other litigation that some or all the material covered  
 11    by the subpoena or order is the subject of this Protective Order. In addition, the Receiving Party  
 12    must deliver a copy of this Stipulated Protective Order promptly to the party in the other action  
 13    that caused the subpoena or order to issue.

14          The purpose of imposing these duties is to alert the interested parties to the  
 15    existence of this Protective Order and to afford the Designating Party in this case an opportunity  
 16    to try to protect its confidentiality interests in the court from which the subpoena or order issued.  
 17    The Designating Party shall bear the burdens and the expenses of seeking protection in that court  
 18    of its confidential material – and nothing in these provisions should be construed as authorizing or  
 19    encouraging a Receiving Party in this action to disobey a lawful directive from another court.

20          9.     UNAUTHORIZED DISCLOSURE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL

21          If a Receiving Party learns that, by inadvertence or otherwise, it has disclosed Protected  
 22    Material to any person or in any circumstance not authorized under this Stipulated Protective  
 23    Order, the Receiving Party must immediately (a) notify in writing the Designating Party of the  
 24    unauthorized disclosures, (b) use its best efforts to retrieve all copies of the Protected Material,  
 25    (c) inform the person or persons to whom unauthorized disclosures were made of all the terms of  
 26    this Order, and (d) request such person or persons to execute the “Acknowledgment and  
 27    Agreement to Be Bound” that is attached hereto as Exhibit A.



10. FILING PROTECTED MATERIAL. Without written permission from the Designating Party or a court order secured after appropriate notice to all interested persons, a Party may not file in the public record in this action any Protected Material. A Party that seeks to file under seal any Protected Material must comply with Civil Local Rule 79-5.

11. FINAL DISPOSITION. Unless otherwise ordered or agreed in writing by the Producing Party, within sixty days after the final termination of this action, each Receiving Party must return all Protected Material to the Producing Party. As used in this subdivision, "all Protected Material" includes all copies, abstracts, compilations, summaries or any other form of reproducing or capturing any of the Protected Material. With permission in writing from the Designating Party, the Receiving Party may destroy some or all of the Protected Material instead of returning it. Whether the Protected Material is returned or destroyed, the Receiving Party must submit a written certification to the Producing Party (and, if not the same person or entity, to the Designating Party) by the sixty day deadline that identifies (by category, where appropriate) all the Protected Material that was returned or destroyed and that affirms that the Receiving Party has not retained any copies, abstracts, compilations, summaries or other forms of reproducing or capturing any of the Protected Material. Notwithstanding this provision, Counsel are entitled to retain an archival copy of all pleadings, motion papers, transcripts, legal memoranda, correspondence or attorney work product, even if such materials contain Protected Material. Any such archival copies that contain or constitute Protected Material remain subject to this Protective Order as set forth in Section 4 (DURATION), above.

12. MISCELLANEOUS

12.1 Right to Further Relief. Nothing in this Order abridges the right of any person to seek its modification by the Court in the future.

12.2 Right to Assert Other Objections. By stipulating to the entry of this Protective Order no Party waives any right it otherwise would have to object to disclosing or producing any information or item on any ground not addressed in this Stipulated Protective Order. Similarly, no Party waives any right to object on any ground to use in evidence of any of the material covered by this Protective Order.




1 IT IS SO STIPULATED, THROUGH COUNSEL OF RECORD.

2  
3 DATED: August 14, 2008

  
Attorneys for Defendant

4  
5 DATED: August 15, 2008

  
Attorneys for Plaintiff

6  
7 PURSUANT TO STIPULATION, IT IS SO ORDERED.

8  
9 DATED: August , 2008


  
Hon. William J. H. Alsup  
United States District/Magistrate Judge

EXHIBIT AACKNOWLEDGMENT AND AGREEMENT TO BE BOUND

I, \_\_\_\_\_ [print or type full name], of \_\_\_\_\_ [print or type full address], declare under penalty of perjury that I have read in its entirety and understand the Stipulated Protective Order that was issued by the United States District Court for the Northern District of California on [date] in the case of *Williams v. Boston Scientific Corporation, et al.*, Case No. 3:08-CV-01437-WHA, pending before the Honorable William H. Alsup (the "Protective Order"). I agree to comply with and to be bound by all the terms of this Stipulated Protective Order and I understand and acknowledge that failure to so comply could expose me to sanctions and punishment in the nature of contempt. I solemnly promise that I will not disclose in any manner any information or item that is subject to this Stipulated Protective Order to any person or entity except in strict compliance with the provisions of this Order.

I further agree to submit to the jurisdiction of the United States District Court for the Northern District of California for the purpose of enforcing the terms of this Stipulated Protective Order, even if such enforcement proceedings occur after termination of this action.

I hereby appoint \_\_\_\_\_ [print or type full name] of \_\_\_\_\_ [print or type full address and telephone number] as my California agent for service of process in connection with this action or any proceedings related to enforcement of this Stipulated Protective Order.

Date: \_\_\_\_\_

City and State where sworn and signed: \_\_\_\_\_

Printed name: \_\_\_\_\_  
[printed name]

Signature: \_\_\_\_\_  
[signature]

Dated: August \_\_\_\_\_, 2008

MORGAN, LEWIS & BOCKIUS LLP

By \_\_\_\_\_

DB2/20801475.2